

WORKABLE SOLUTIONS TO THE PROBLEM OF STREET PROSTITUTION IN BUFFALO

Presented by the Prostitution Task Force

October 1999

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction

Prostitution Task Force

ICOPS Grant

Customers of Street Walking Prostitutes (Johns)

Street Walking Prostitutes

Community Survey

Focus Group With Ex-Prostitutes

Prostitution Statistics in Buffalo

Strategies Aimed at Johns

Operation Johnny

John School

Shaming

Automobile Seizures and Forfeitures

Letter Writing

Strategies Aimed at Prostitutes

Temporary Restraining Orders

Outreach Activities

Strategies Aimed at Johns & Prostitutes

Environmental Design

Non-Enforcement Zones

Legalization and Decriminalization

Multi-Agency Approaches

Summary of Recommendations

INTRODUCTION

Prostitution is the exchange of sexual favors for payment. The problems associated with street prostitution affect both the prostitute as well as the community in which he or she works. Prostitutes often suffer physical and sexual abuse, yet alienation from society, societal labeling, criminal records, addiction to drugs, lack of marketable skills and low self-esteem all work to prevent prostitutes from leaving the trade. Residential and commercial areas are also subject to problems associated with prostitution. Community groups argue that prostitution creates traffic congestion, noise, litter, harassment of residents and declining property values. Residents who live in the midst of prostitute-infested areas feel threatened, particularly when johns proposition women who live in those neighborhoods or when sexual transactions are performed in parked cars, empty lots and alleys. Business people in the commercial districts cite loss of sales and attraction of a criminal element (i.e. drug trade) as concerns arising from street prostitution.

In the past, police have tended to concentrate on arresting the prostitutes, but some argue that the real problem is the customer. Customers hold up traffic and create nightmares for nearby residents as they barter with prostitutes for their services, which are more often than not performed in residential neighborhoods. Each morning, young children on the way to school have to pass yards and alleys that are littered with used condoms and drug paraphernalia. Some feel that the only way to deal effectively with street prostitution is to dry up the demand.

In the early to mid '90s, Buffalo began implementing a variety of interventions focusing on the johns. The Allentown Association purchased billboards that told the patrons of prostitution that they were being watched and were not welcome. Convicted johns were given alternative sentences. Some were sentenced to community service in the same Buffalo neighborhoods where the prostitution occurred. One particularly creative assignment for johns involved sweeping streets, picking up discarded syringes and condoms left behind by the prostitutes. Other convicted johns were directed to learn about AIDS and then lecture community groups about it. Convicted patrons' cars were confiscated as well.

Street prostitution and proposals for addressing it have sparked heated debates between law enforcement agencies and residential and business communities. Proposed solutions range from increasing the punitive nature of prostitution-related laws to legalizing prostitution and implementing more social programs. New and more imaginative approaches used in other communities have shown that long term solutions can be found and that a reduction in the impact of prostitution on residential neighborhoods is possible.

This paper does not attempt to examine the social and economic factors associated with entry

into prostitution, or the impact of prostitution on our community. Rather, approaches currently being used in Buffalo to reduce the level of prostitution-related activities are examined, and approaches used in other communities are reviewed. The paper is divided into four sections: the first section provides an overview of strategies identified through interviews with prostitutes, johns and members of the community; the second section examines practices used to deter and punish those who procure the services of prostitutes ("johns"); the third section focuses on strategies aimed at the prostitutes themselves, including a discussion of some innovative social programs that have been implemented to help prostitutes cope with their lifestyle and, if desired, leave the trade; and the fourth section addresses strategies aimed at both johns and prostitutes, focusing on recommendations regarding changes in environment and location to reduce activity.

PROSTITUTION TASK FORCE

The Prostitution Task Force, originally a committee of the West Side Neighborhood Congress, was formed in 1995 as a result of growing concern over street prostitution in the City of Buffalo. The Task Force was a rebirth of a prior successful one, which brought community residents, social service organizations and local businesses together to protest the serious and negative effects of street prostitution on our community.

Task Force objectives included:

1. Implementing immediate actions within existing laws to discourage solicitation and prostitution activities;
2. Identifying the range of problems that have emerged in Buffalo communities as a result of street prostitution;
3. Reviewing successful strategies that have been implemented in other communities to reduce street prostitution;
4. Recommending changes in the criminal law and judicial procedures to more effectively reduce prostitution activities; and
5. Establishing sound linkages between key stakeholders (legal and law enforcement representatives, residents, social service providers, drug rehabilitation centers and elected officials) to develop a common agenda and comprehensive strategy.

Since its inception, the Task Force has been instrumental in starting several innovative programs to reduce the impact of prostitution on our neighborhoods. Self-supporting programs such as the John School and the Magdalene program for drug-addicted prostitutes have become national models. The Erie County District Attorney has also instituted new plea policies designed to aid in these efforts. The effects have been extremely positive. In the past few years, the number of arrests has increased and the number of 911 calls for prostitution has decreased dramatically. More importantly, neighborhoods have seen a big improvement.

Recently, however, the momentum created by these efforts slowed. From October 1998 -

August 1999, the number of prostitution arrests declined and arrests of johns ceased altogether. According to the Buffalo Police Department, the cessation of Operation Johnny was due to change in the method of appointment to the position of detective and the elimination of the position of "acting detective" in 1998 by the Buffalo Common Council. This meant that, until recently, the Commissioner could not appoint temporary "operatives," who had previously been used as decoys to arrest johns. In September 1999, Operation Johnny was re-instated.

Whatever the cause, the results were clear. Without Operation Johnny, several neighborhoods are once again began reporting rampant prostitution activity, affecting the quality of life in these neighborhoods and throughout the City.

ICOPS GRANT

In October 1997, a \$145,407 Problem Solving Partnership grant from the U.S. Justice Department was awarded to the Buffalo Police Department, the Allentown Association and the University at Buffalo to work together on a problem solving project to reduce the incidence of street prostitution in the Allentown area of Buffalo and to minimize the impact of prostitution on residential neighborhoods. The group also set out to find ways to help women involved in prostitution access needed services and escape prostitution. The group decided that displacement to other areas of the City was not an acceptable solution and wished to take into consideration ways to avoid displacement. Finally, the group was interested in both short and long term solutions to the problem and for that purpose worked closely with other members of the Prostitution Task Force to research solutions to the problem utilized by other cities. Although originally intended as a one-year grant, the grant period was extended until April 30, 1999.

The primary partners on the project were the Buffalo Police Department and the Allentown Association, with the University at Buffalo as the facilitator, data collector and evaluator. Other key partners included the District Attorney's Office (Community Prosecution Unit), the courts, the city councilperson for the district, the state assemblyman's office and local social service agencies that provide services to prostitutes including Beacon Center, an outpatient alcohol and drug treatment center, and TRY House, a supervised shelter for women between the ages of 16-25. All of the above agencies and individuals attend monthly meetings of the Prostitution Task Force. Other key people involved in the project included the Director of the John School, a former prostitute who works with the group and teaches at the John School and representatives of neighborhood block clubs.

During the Summer of 1998, the University at Buffalo began conducting interviews with prostitutes, johns, residents and businesses. Fifteen prostitutes were interviewed regarding what types of services they would be most likely to use, how to make those services efficient and accessible, and how to publicize the availability throughout the population. Prostitutes were paid \$10 per completed interview, plus \$5 for each successful referral. 127 johns were also surveyed to find out what might deter their activities. 116 residents were surveyed via telephone to find out which strategies for combating street prostitution are palatable to them and under what conditions. A focus group interview was conducted with 9 persons at Beacon Center, a service agency that conducts the Magdalene program for prostitutes in recovery for both drug addiction and prostitution. Businesses in the Elmwood-Virginia area were also contacted for their

perspective.

RESULTS

Surveys were designed by the Buffalo Police Department, the Prostitution Task Force and the University at Buffalo. The prostitute and john surveys were administered and analyzed by the University at Buffalo School of Social Work and the citizen survey was conducted by the UB School of Management.

Customers of Street Walking Prostitutes (Johns)

One hundred twenty-seven men completed self-administered surveys while attending a daylong John School session over a six-month period. Ninety-six were White, 21 were Black/African American, 5 were Asian, 2 were Latino/Hispanic, 1 was Native American/Indian and two others identified themselves as Other. Participants ranged in age from 19 to 81. The participants' highest level of education ranged from completion of second grade to 10 years of college education. Sixty were married, 41 were single, 15 were divorced, 5 were separated, 1 was widowed and 4 were either involved or living with someone. One hundred and three identified themselves as heterosexual while 2 identified as bisexual. Twenty-two men did not reveal their sexual orientation. Sixty-six of them listed Buffalo as their place of residence. Their survey responses are summarized in the charts that follow:

Table 1: Why Johns Solicit Prostitutes

Reasons Number

Felt the urge for sex	64
Loneliness	26
Wife/partner does not understand needs	22
Under the influence of drugs	15
Can't get sex anywhere else	11
Wanted power and control	9
Wanted access to drugs	4

Table 2: How Johns Choose Their Neighborhoods

Reasons Number

Where prostitutes are known to be	41
-----------------------------------	----

Was just passing through	41
Was heading home	26
Live in the neighborhood	17
Friends/relatives live in the neighborhood	11
No one around here knows me	8
Was referred	5
Other (going to work, am innocent, etc.)	5
Wanted access to drugs	2

Table 3: Fear Most When Soliciting a Prostitute

Fears Number

Being arrested	66
Risk to health	26
Publicity	8
Other (going to hell, being found out, etc.)	6
Safety issues	3
Seizure of vehicle	1

Table 4: Drug Habits of Johns*

Response Number

Currently use drugs	59
Alcohol	41
Tobacco products	31
Marijuana	17
Cocaine (powdered or crack)	6
Sedatives	4

Other (antidepressants, etc.)	2
Amphetamines	1
Acid	1

*The question on drug habits of johns allowed for multiple responses.

Table 5: Possible Solutions to Prostitution

Response Number

Ignore the problem	51
Arrest johns and prostitutes	51
Legalize prostitution	24
Allow in red light districts	24
Impose stiffer penalties	17
Show photos of prostitutes in the media	15
Show photos of johns in the media	11

Street Walking Prostitutes

Fifteen prostitutes participated in face-to-face interviews: 8 women, 5 men and 2 male to female transsexuals. Six of the participants were African American, 5 Latino/a, 3 White and 1 identified as Other. Participants ranged in age from 26 to 41 years old. The participants' highest level of education ranged from completion of eighth grade to completion of two years of college. Six of the participants identified their sexual orientation as heterosexual, 5 as bisexual and 4 as gay or lesbian. One participant was married, 5 were single, 3 were separated and 2 were divorced. Of the 3 participants with children under eighteen, only 1 had custody of them. Five other participants said that the state had taken custody of their children, but all of these children are now over 18.

Table 1: Childhood Trauma

Trauma Number

Parent or close family member died	11
------------------------------------	----

Parents divorced	8
Sexually abused	7
Parent drug dependent or alcoholic	6
Moved a lot	5
Physically abused	5
Verbally abused	2

Table 2: Drug Use

Drug Ever Currently

Tobacco	14	14
Cocaine	14	9
Marijuana	13	6
Alcohol	12	7
Heroin	12	6
Uppers	6	0
Sedatives	6	4
Inhalants	5	0
Other drugs	5	1

Table 3: Reasons for Sex Work

Reasons for Sex Work Starting Currently

To support drug habit	13	11
To make a living	12	8
Extra cash	12	12
No choice but sex work	6	4
To support kids	4	3

Coerced	2	1
Companionship	2	2

Table 4: Reasons for Working in Lower West Side

Reason Number

High traffic	15
Because I feel safe there	13
I live in the neighborhood	11
Area is the known stroll	10
All night businesses	10
Easy access to drugs	9
Everyone knows me in this area	8
No one knows me in this area	5
Good lighting	5
Referred to this area by another sex worker	4

Table 5: Frequent Places for Having Sex with Clients

Location Number

Customer's car	13
Motel	13
Customer's home	11
Alley	8
Abandoned building	5
Crack house	3

Table 6: Fears About Sex Work

Fears Number

Safety	6
Risk to health	6
Arrest	4
Losing custody of children	3
Publicity	0
Fines	0
Community service	0

Table 7: Reasons to Quit Sex Work

Reasons Number

When I quit drugs	10
Dangers	9
Legal implications	7
Better working conditions	5
For a better job	4
To keep kids	3

Table 8: Barriers to Quitting Sex Work

Barriers Number

Inadequate income	11
Drug habit	10
Worry about being able to get another job	9
Low self-esteem	8
Lack of education/job training	8

Lack of transportation	6
Lack of housing	4

Table 9: Social Services Needed to Quit Sex Work

Service Number

Job training	13
Transportation	11
Clothing	11
Continuing education	10
Health care	9
Drug counseling	9
Food allowance	8
Housing	8
Peer support outreach	7
Needle exchange	4

Table 10: Social Services Previously Received

Services Received Number

Medicaid	15
Public assistance	14
Food stamps	14
Transportation	7
WIC	3
Section 8 housing	2
Continuing education	2
Subsidized child care	1

Job training	0
--------------	---

Community Survey

In the summer of 1998, 116 households were surveyed over the telephone regarding the problem of prostitution in the geographic area patrolled by District B of the Buffalo Police Department. The sample was selected from registered voters living in those areas of District B with a high concentration of 911 calls related to prostitution in 1996. Most respondents owned their homes (53.4%). Nearly 88% (n=112) had lived in the neighborhood for 3 or more years, with a range of from less than 1 year to more than 79 years. The mean number of years was 17. Approximately 70% (n=82) had intentions of staying in the neighborhood while 19.8% had plans of departing from the neighborhood. Approximately 8% stated that crime was playing a factor in their decision to leave the neighborhood.

Nearly 46% of the persons surveyed reported that a block club existed in their neighborhood. Of this number, 26.7% stated that they were members of a block club. Many respondents (81.9%) felt that neighborhood properties were either very well maintained, or generally well maintained. Over 92% of residents queried stated that they felt safe while walking around their neighborhood during the day. This dropped to 49.2% when asked about their comfort level of walking around the neighborhood at night. When specific reasons for feeling unsafe were elicited, issues involving an increase in general criminal activity, the diversity of persons seen in the neighborhood, drug activity, panhandlers, gangs and prostitution were commonly cited. Drug and prostitution-related activities seemed to be at the forefront of the items mentioned.

Of those surveyed, 40% had observed prostitution activity in the neighborhood while 60% had never (to their knowledge) observed prostitution activity in their neighborhood. Over 37% of all respondents considered prostitution to be a problem in their neighborhood. Persons answering affirmatively that prostitution was a problem in their neighborhoods were also asked when they thought it occurred. Nearly 80% stated that it occurred in the evening or late at night, while 42% thought that it also occurred in the morning. These same respondents also thought that Fridays and Saturdays were the days they most likely would witness prostitution activities.

Table 1: Suggested Solutions

Solutions Yes No

Programs and services to help	85.3% (n=81)	9.5% (n=11)
Arrest customers (johns)	72.4% (n=84)	17.2% (n=20)
Arrest prostitutes	69.8% (n=81)	19% (n=22)

Stiffer penalties for customers	65.5% (n=76)	22.4% (n=26)
Publish names of customers	56% (n=65)	29.3% (n=34)
Stiffer penalties for prostitutes	50.9% (n=81)	19% (n=22)
Legalize prostitution	28.4% (n=33)	52.6% (n=61)
Develop red light districts	24.1% (n=28)	55.2% (n=64)

The above findings suggest that residents are quite supportive of arresting both prostitutes and customers (johns). They also support imposing stiffer penalties and sentences on prostitutes and johns. Sixty-five percent of respondents favor stiffer penalties for johns; however, only 50.9% favor the same action for prostitutes. Most respondents were not in favor of supporting activities that would condone prostitution activities even if the activities took place in red light districts (24.1%) or were legalized and regulated (28.4%). Nearly 86% of respondents were supportive of services and programs that would decrease these activities by helping people get out of this line of work.

Focus Group With Magdalene Program Participants

Nine persons in the Magdalene program were interviewed at the Beacon Center on February 5, 1999. All of them reported being sexually abused, and almost all had had previous unsuccessful treatment attempts. When asked what services they required, help with self-esteem was mentioned most often. They also stated a need for a support system or network. The women explained that each person is an individual and needs to be treated as such. Since needs differ dramatically, there should be a caseworker to interview each woman, assess needs and do referrals. They also stated that relationship with money is an enormous issue, and that any extra money is a trigger to buy drugs. The director of the program, Faith Cole, feels that even women-specific groups for alcohol and drug use aren't enough. Because the existence of a support system is so critical, in order to be successful, programs must be specific to prostitutes.

PROSTITUTION STATISTICS IN BUFFALO

Crime and arrest statistics from the Buffalo Police Department indicate that arresting johns reduces the incidence of street prostitution perhaps even more than arresting prostitutes. As the number of john arrests increased (by 85% from 1996 to 1997), the rate of prostitution arrests did not increase proportionately (28%), and, most importantly, the number of 911 calls regarding prostitution decreased significantly (37%). From 1996 to 1998, 911 calls were reduced by 50%.

In 1996, there were 999 calls for service to Buffalo's 911 center specific to prostitution. That same year there were 590 arrests for prostitution in the City of Buffalo. Of these, 168 were male and 422 were female. However, these were mostly arrests for loitering for the purpose of prostitution, which are very difficult to prosecute. When these cases were removed, only a total of 124 cases (26 prostitutes and 98 johns) were able to be prosecuted by the District Attorney for

all of 1996. The District Attorney's Community Prosecution Unit that focused on misdemeanor crimes affecting the quality of life of the neighborhoods was established in early 1996, and the Buffalo Police Department began Operation Johnny in the summer of 1996.

In 1997, there were 630 prostitution-related calls to the 911 system. A total of 814 prostitution-related arrests were made: 407 prostitutes and 205 johns were arrested for either engaging in prostitution or patronizing a prostitute, both class B misdemeanors. Of the johns, 205 of the cases were prosecuted, with 162 offenders sentenced to john school, and with all but 21 receiving adjudication in contemplation of dismissal. An additional 30 received community service with conditional discharges and one served jail time. Of the prostitutes, 14 offenders were given 90 day sentences, 30 received 60 days and 21 received 30 days. 79 have outstanding warrants. Since prostitutes are given appearance tickets instead of going to the holding center, they often simply fail to come back to court. Statistics from the District Attorney's office show that in 1997, 66% of the prostitutes arrested were repeat offenders while only 8% of the johns were repeat offenders.

In 1998, there were 511 calls to 911 regarding prostitution. This represents a nearly 50% drop since 1996. A total of 602 cases at the B misdemeanor level were prosecuted. Of the 357 cases of prostitution prosecuted, 25 received 90 days, 32 were given 60 days, 22 received 45 days and 17 received 30 days. Of the 245 cases of solicitation, 8 persons were given jail time and 159 were mandated to attend john school.

Interviews with prostitutes indicate that arrest is not a deterrent (only 27% cited it as a fear). For johns, arrest is a more effective deterrent. Over 50% of the johns surveyed indicated that this was their most significant fear associated with soliciting a prostitute. The recidivism rate for the general population of johns is about 8% while for those attending John School it is .05%. A total of 53 persons arrested for prostitution were mandated to the Magdalene Program in 1997 and 1998. Approximately 30 persons have completed the program, with only 1 re-arrest.

It is unclear how much the war on prostitution costs the Buffalo taxpayers. National studies have found that average arrest, court and incarceration costs amount to nearly \$2,000.00 per arrest. Cities spend an average of 7.5 million dollars on prostitution control every year, ranging from 1 million dollars (Memphis) to 23 million dollars (New York City). A San Francisco Task Force has placed the cost for that city at 7.6 million dollars per year.

Figure 1 provides a breakdown of the 1997 prostitution cases and how they were resolved:

Figure 1: 1997 Prostitution Cases

PROSTITUTES JOHNS

TOTAL 407 205

PLEA TO CHARGE 130 12

90 DAYS 14 -

75 DAYS 1 -

60 DAYS 30 -

30 DAYS 21 -

15 DAYS 5 -

7 DAYS 7 -

COMMUNITY SERVICE 2 8

DRUG COURT 1 -

FINE 1 5

JOHN SCHOOL - 2

CONDITIONAL DISCHARGE 17 3

LESSER PLEA 133 42

15 DAYS 47 1

10 DAYS 5 -

7 DAYS 8 -

COMMUNITY SERVICE 16 30

FINE 5 6

DRUG COURT 1 -

CONDITIONAL DISCHARGE 49 30

UNCONDITIONAL DISCHARGE 1 -

JOHN SCHOOL - 21

ACD 7 -

ACD & JOHN SCHOOL - 141

GUILTY AT TRIAL

FINE - 1

COMMUNITY SERVICE - 1

NOT GUILTY AT TRIAL 1 1

OUTSTANDING WARRANT 79 5

DISMISSED 9 2

DRUG COURT 23 -

MAGDALENE PROGRAM 25 -

Figure 2 describes the sentences given to prostitutes by each of the 11 city court judges: Amadeo, Anderson, Carney, Figueroa, Franczyk, Manz, Murphy, Ogden, Pietruszka, Russo, and Troutman

Figure 2: Prostitute Sentences for 1997

LESSER PLEA / PLEA TO CHARGE OR CONVICTION

SENTENCE	AM	AND	CAR	FIG	FRA	MAN	MUR	OGD	PIE	RUS	TRO
90 DAY		-1		-2	-1		-1	-1		-6	-2
75 DAY	-1										
60 DAY	-2			-2	-2	-2		-2	-4	-9	-7
45 DAY	-5		-1	-2		-3	-2		-4	-2	-2

30 DAY	-/3	-/1	-/1	-/1	-/4	-/6		-/1	-/3	-/3	
15 DAY	6/-	6/-	5/1	3/-		4/-	4/-	2/-	7/-	2/-	10/
10 DAY									2/-	2/-	2/-
7 DAY		1/1	1/1	-/1	2/1	-/1	1/-	-/1	2/-		
Comm. Service		-/1			5/-		1/-	9/-	2/-		
FINE				-/1	1/-	1/-					1/-
Drug Court	-/1					-/1				-/3	
Cond. Discharge	11/3	5/3	4/-	1/-	9/-	4/1	12/1	11/-	4/2	3/-	6/2
Probation		-/1					-/1		-/3	-/2	
ACD	1		2			1					
Uncon. Discharge				1/-							

Figure 3 describes the sentences handed out to johns by each of the eleven city court judges.

Figure 3: John Sentences for 1997

LESSER PLEA / PLEA TO CHARGE OR CONVICTION

		A	C	F	F	M	M	O	P	R	T
SENTENCE	AMO	N	A	I	R	A	U	G	I	U	R
		D	R	G	A	N	R	D	E	S	O
15 DAY		1/-									
Comm. Service					1/3	1/-		4/3	-/2	-/1	-/1

FINE		1/-			2/3	1/-	1/-	-/1		1/-	2/2
John School	1/-	14/-			1/-	-/1	2/-	2/-			
Cond. Discharge	3/1	14/-	-/1		3/-	-/1	3/1	4/-	3/-	-/1	-/1
ACD& John School	12		14	10	19	20	2	9	26	21	12
ACD	1					1			2		1

Figure 4: 1998 Prostitution Cases

PROSTITUTES JOHNS

TOTAL 357 245

PLEA TO CHARGE 160 17

90 DAYS 24

75 DAYS 1

60 DAYS 32 3

45 DAYS 22 1

30 DAYS 17 1

15 DAYS 9

7 DAYS 2

COMM SERV & SCHOOL 2

COMMUNITY SERVICE 11 1

DRUG COURT 13

FINE 5

JOHN SCHOOL 5
COND DISCHARGE 21 1
PROBATION 7 2
LESSER PLEA 86 73
15 DAYS 31 2
10 DAYS 14
7 DAYS 9 1
COMMUNITY SERVICE 5 7
COMM SERV & SCHOOL 1
FINE 1 7
DRUG COURT 4
COND DISCHARGE 22 8
UNCOND DISCHARGE 1
JOHN SCHOOL 46
ACD & COMM SERV 13
ACD 10 14
ACD & JOHN SCHOOL 108
GUILTY - TRIAL 1 1
90 DAYS 1
COMMUNITY SERVICE 1
NOT GUILTY - TRIAL 1
WARRANT 43 11
DISMISSED 7 6

DRUG COURT 26 2

MAG PROGRAM 23

STRATEGIES AIMED AT JOHNS

OPERATION JOHNNY

Buffalo, NY

In late 1996, at the request of the Prostitution Task Force, the Buffalo Police Narcotics and Vice Unit began a concentrated effort to combat the problem of street prostitution. Male and female undercover detectives were assigned to arrest both prostitutes and their male counterparts known as johns. The Buffalo Police Department assured Task Force members that this would be a long-term commitment, and not just a quick-fix sweep. The work of the Police Department from that time until October 1998 was outstanding. Arrests increased nearly six-fold and calls to the 911 system regarding prostitution were reduced by nearly 50%. The District Attorney's Office worked with the courts to establish alternative sentencing for first offenders who pay a fee to attend a John School established by the Prostitution Task Force. Operation Johnny ceased in October 1998 due to a change in the appointment process for the position of detective, but was re-instated in September 1999. In 1997, the recidivism rate for persons arrested for solicitation was only 8% and for those who attended the John School it was .05%. The recidivism rate for prostitutes arrested in 1997 was 66%.

Niagara Falls, Ontario

Called Operation Break John, Niagara Falls' version of Operation Johnny is operated by the Niagara Regional Police. Police officers employed in High Enforcement Action Team (HEAT) units target men who solicit streetwalkers, under the direction of the District Commander. In one sting during the summer of 1998, a total of 65 johns were arrested, ranging in age from 17 to 67. Twenty-nine of those were U.S. residents, including five Tonawanda residents. Others came from Buffalo, Niagara Falls and Brockport. Typically police make about 150 arrests annually in Niagara Falls, Ontario for soliciting prostitution. These men, who are charged with communicating for the purpose of prostitution, face up to a \$1,000 fine and possible jail time. U.S. citizens face deportation and a possible lifelong ban from Canada.

Vancouver, British Columbia

Believing that going after pimps and johns is more effective in reducing street prostitution, the Vancouver Police Department decided in 1997 to stop arresting most prostitutes. According to

Inspector Ken Doern, head of the Vancouver vice squad, "We look at sex trade workers as already being victimized. Our policy now is not charging any females unless there's unusual circumstances. It may be someone quite young and we may need a court order to get them assistance...In the past, prostitutes have been penalized, jailed, fined and shifted from neighborhood to neighborhood, but no concentrated effort was made to go after the customers, and we firmly believe these men are predators."

The new policy was based in part on the department's experience from the previous year. In 1996, the police began to arrest johns and pimps more often. By the end of the year they had an 87 percent reduction in prostituted-related offenses as compared to 1995. Charges dropped from 944 in 1995 to 121 in 1996.

According to John Lowman, a Simon Fraser University criminologist, a study done between 1986 and 1992 in Vancouver shows that charging sex workers isn't much of a deterrent. However, the same isn't true of their customers. During that time period, 2,045 men were charged with communicating for the purpose of prostitution, and only 44 repeated the offense. By contrast, the recidivism rate for prostitutes was approximately 80 percent.

Recommendation for Buffalo

Arrest is a deterrent for johns and not for prostitutes so enforcement efforts should be directed at the customers, not the prostitutes. Operation Johnny provides participants for the John School and those funds are used for outreach to prostitutes. To avoid displacement, Operation Johnny should be continued on a citywide basis.

B. JOHN SCHOOL

John School is a diversion program that was originally developed in San Francisco, California and has since been replicated in Toronto, Portland and elsewhere. The goal is to prevent recidivism in those who have been charged for the first time by educating them about the risks.

Buffalo, New York

Buffalo's John School is patterned after the San Francisco and Toronto initiatives. Like the San Francisco and Toronto programs, it is offered as a voluntary alternative to court for first offenders and attempts to revise the men's attitudes towards women, power and sex through an eight-hour classroom lecture on morals, health risks, legal ramifications and punishments in the case of future arrests. Neighborhood impact lectures are included and two former prostitutes regularly speak as well. Speakers also include neighborhood activists who talk about the toll prostitution takes on local neighborhoods. An Erie County Health Department nurse talks frankly about sexually transmitted diseases, and substance abuse and sex addiction counselors offer rehabilitative services. Unlike in other cities with similar programs, the Buffalo Police Department has no formal relationship with the John School. Classes are held one or two Saturdays a month with an average class size of 12-15.

Johns who attend the School and donate \$100 to the program have the potential, if they stay out

of trouble for six months, to have the charges dropped and their records sealed. Since October 1996, a total of 354 students have participated. The John School appears to be reducing the rate of recidivism among johns. While recidivism for the general population of johns arrested is 8%, for those who have taken John School, it is .05%. Only two of the graduates have been arrested a second time. The school is currently held at Concerned Ecumenical Ministries (CEM), its third location. An advisory board that includes representatives from the Allentown Association and the Prostitution Task Force oversees its operations.

Total expenses associated with the running of the John School are \$1200 per session and include the cost of meeting space and staff salaries. The participants pay for the program; it costs the taxpayers nothing.

San Francisco, California

The following is taken from an article on the San Francisco John School:

The sixty men were slumped in their chairs, weary with the weight of the former prostitute's insults. "I hated you!" she said, hurling her words so that the men in the back row with their heads in their hands would take notice. They did, snapping to attention as though they had been pinched. "I wanted to stick a knife in you!" the woman shouted, jolting an old man so hard that he knocked his glasses off his face.

It was not even lunch time and the men had already endured a prosecutor's hour long lecture on the law against soliciting, close-up color slides showing the affects of venereal disease, and three other angry ex-prostitutes. In the afternoon there would be lectures from police officers, business owners and residents of prostitution-plagued neighborhoods. And for this daylong humiliation in a drafty room in the San Francisco Hall of Justice, the men paid \$500 and considered themselves lucky: Their first arrest for soliciting sex would be wiped from their records, never to haunt them. Unless, of course, they get caught a second time.

Welcome to San Francisco's answer to the world's oldest profession. Modeled after daylong traffic schools for bad drivers, the First Offender Prostitution Program attempts to tackle the sex trade by trying to drum some sense into those who perpetuate it. The police say the program, the first of its kind, is working splendidly. Of the 2,181 men who took the class in its first four years, only 18 have been re-arrested and prosecuted after their names were checked against the program's list of participants. The program's success has created such a buzz all over the country that several cities, including Fresno, Las Vegas, Toronto and Nashville have fashioned similar programs and others are considering them.

No one contends that the program will put a stop to prostitution. Massage parlors, escort services, strip clubs and other fronts for the sex trade are prevalent in San Francisco. But together with an aggressive outreach program that helps prostitutes find an alternative to street life and relentless police undercover operations that arrest the men who buy sex, the first offender program, the police say, has led to a sharp, visible drop in San Francisco's outdoor sex trade. They claim that for a city of nearly 800,000 people, the level of street prostitution is

relatively small, reduced to one or two spots.

In the fall of 1998, the First Offender Prostitution Program won a \$100,000 Innovations in American Government award from the Ford Foundation, the John F. Kennedy School of Government at Harvard and the Council for Excellence in Government. The award led to an avalanche of requests to visit from law enforcement officials throughout the country. In February 1999 alone, 45 officials from seven cities (Portland, Seattle, Pittsburgh, Washington, Jacksonville, Springfield and St. Paul) came for a look.

To Norma Hotaling, a former prostitute who co-founded the program in 1995 with a police lieutenant and an assistant prosecutor, the most exciting part of this war on street sex is the SAGE Project Inc., a nonprofit service organization she runs that helps prostitutes and other women. Since it began as a small outreach group in 1992, the organization, which receives some of its money from the first offender program, has helped over 500 young women get off the streets. Fifteen of those now work full time at the project.

Recommendation for Buffalo

Since October 1996, out of 354 men who have attended the John School, there have been only two rearrests. Many successful referrals have been made to participating agencies, such as Project Reach, for HIV testing; the Erie County Health Department, for sexually transmitted disease testing and counseling; sex addiction counseling; and ECMC for drug abuse and alcohol counseling. The participants, in their exit evaluations, have told us what a positive experience John School was for them. And information and on-site HIV testing is provided to a population who, for the most part, is ignorant about the risks involved in such behavior and who would continue in this lifestyle were it not for Operation Johnny, the District Attorney's office and the City Court Judges who allow the pleas to be taken in their courtrooms.

Since the John School costs \$1200 per session to run, the program breaks even with twelve participants and makes a profit with thirteen or more. Thus, in Buffalo, as in San Francisco and Toronto, John School is a program that not only pays for itself but that generates additional revenues for interventions aimed at prostitutes. Some of the proceeds from the John School are used to fund group counseling at TRY House, a residential rehabilitation center for young women arrested for prostitution. Another advantage of the John School is that it doesn't clog up the courts or the jails.

Therefore, we believe that the John School should be continued for first-time offenders. Further, John School fees should be raised in order to continue and expand support for programs for prostitutes. Currently the fee for John School is \$100. In San Francisco, they charge \$500. The John School Advisory Board should prepare a request to city court asking to increase the fee. This request should include a description of future programs that could be funded if the fee were raised.

C. SHAMING

A drunken driver is ordered to carry in his wallet pictures of the people he killed. A wife-beater

must apologize to his victim from the courthouse steps, with cameras rolling. A shoplifter is forced to pace outside the market from which she pilfered, wearing a huge sign that brands her a convicted thief. In a modern day version of the stocks and scarlet letters of colonial times, a small but attention-getting group of judges across the United States - fed up with a revolving cast of drug buyers, drunken drivers, johns and shoplifters who never seem to get the message - has been sentencing criminals to shame. They hope public humiliation succeeds where jail habitually fails.

"I think this type of sentencing is important," said Ted Poe, a Harris County, Texas, district judge who has become nationally known for what he calls public punishments. "The people I see have too good a self-esteem," he said. "I don't want 'em to leave the courthouse having warm fuzzies inside." Poe says that of the 59 shaming sentences he's given out in the past three years, he knows of only two offenders who have been arrested again.

In recent years, communities around the country have turned to public humiliation as a weapon against prostitution. They have published lists of johns in newspapers, posted signs, taped phone messages and even broadcast their names over the radio. In 1979, New York Mayor Edward Koch touched off a worldwide furor when he announced his plan to broadcast on the city radio station the names of those convicted of patronizing prostitutes in something Koch called "The John Hour." The reading raised so many questions about privacy that it was dropped after its debut show.

Buffalo, NY

In Buffalo, John TV debuted on Tuesday, February 3, 1998 with Niagara Council Member Robert Quintana as host. Three men convicted of prostitution-related charges were featured on the 7:30 p.m. show, which aired on BCTV Channel 18, the city's public access cable channel. Each of the men featured had three convictions. While the show was broadcast only once, it is intended that the John TV program will air as often as there are repeat offenders to publicize. Besides the names, photos, dates of birth, home addresses and recent criminal histories of the featured three, the 30-minute program also talked about John School, the program introduced in October 1996 for first-time offenders. None of the three men featured on John TV had attended the School. One subsequently faced the loss of his City government job because of the disclosure of his activities.

The John TV concept was based on a similar program out of Kansas City, with one notable difference: Buffalo's program features only convicted johns. In Kansas City, the city carries a disclaimer making it clear that the individuals arrested have not yet been convicted.

Buffalo had originally planned to feature six men in its premier episode, but omitted two because details about their criminal histories could not be verified. Another was omitted just hours before the show when his attorney convinced the State Supreme Court to issue a temporary restraining order blocking the showing of his client's name or face. Court papers indicate that the attorney launched the initiative after his client saw a supposedly blacked-out version of the planned John TV broadcast on WIVB-TV (Channel 4) on the morning of February 3 and could tell that the photos were of him and his home. In court papers, the client,

who signed an affidavit using the pseudonym John Doe, claimed he had "successfully completed the John School in 1997 and, therefore, should not be subjected to further ridicule" on television. He also claimed that the airing of his identity would violate his rights to due process and fundamental fairness "even though I have paid the price for my crimes and do not meet the criteria for further ridicule in this fashion." The lawsuit, filed against the City's public access channel, Buffalo Cable Access Media, was dropped in May 1999 when the program was put on hold while the City looked for a new cable operator.

West Palm Beach, Florida

West Palm Beach Mayor Nancy Graham has received national publicity for her hard-nosed fight against prostitution. She at least twice spent city funds to buy newspaper ads naming men arrested for soliciting prostitutes. The mayor decided to print the ads after newspapers declined to print the names on their own. The first ad, a quarter-page in the Palm Beach Post, listed names, ages and hometowns of 57 men arrested for allegedly soliciting prostitutes. The mayor, who signed the ad, acted without City Commission consent, using her own office budget to pay for it.

Although other communities have offered names to newspapers in an effort to deter prostitution, this is believed to be the first time a city has used a paid ad to publish names. The West Palm Beach Neighborhood Association has also purchased banners to hang over the main streets used by prostitutes to let them know that people are watching them.

Kansas City, Missouri

The Kansas City Westport Crime Prevention Commission, a citizens group in Kansas City's popular Westport nightspot area, has developed a taped phone recording, available to the public, notifying them of johns arrested in various months during the past year. The recording tells you the name, race, sex, date of birth and the charge the defendants were arrested for. Callers select from a menu of days and dates to find out who was busted and when. The hotline coincides with a new police policy of mailing letters to the homes of johns who have been arrested. The letters document the offenses and provide information on the risks of contracting AIDS and other diseases. There have been no legal challenges to the hotline, although the commission has received angry calls from agitated men who didn't leave their names.

John TV debuted in Kansas City in May 1997 with a Wednesday morning show on the local government cable television channel. Slowly, color photographs of mostly men and a handful of women appear on the screen. Each photo includes the person's name, date of birth and place of residence - and identifies the person as having been "arrested for municipal offense related to prostitution." Above each picture is this disclaimer: "This person is innocent until found guilty by a court." In its debut, the names and faces of 44 men who had been arrested in an earlier police decoy operation were broadcast. Since then the weekly numbers have ranged from zero to 12. The most prominent person arrested for soliciting prostitution since the program began was a Kansas City Fire Department captain. According to an administrator in the Jackson County Prosecutor's Office, it has absolutely affected demand for prostitution. People are fearful and

arrests are way down.

Minneapolis, Minnesota

Minneapolis uses a web page where anyone arrested for soliciting prostitution has his or her picture posted along with relevant personal information. Once he is convicted, the picture shows a display on the bottom marked "Convicted". The top of the web page contains the disclaimer that "all persons are innocent until convicted in a court of law." Supporters say the photo and the information on the suspect are all a matter of public record, and therefore there is no liability in publishing the information.

Canada

In Edmonton, Toronto and Winnipeg, police have incorporated a program designed to shame johns and deter them from future solicitation of prostitutes. The police send "Dear John" letters to the homes of suspected johns. The letters, which are targeted at the spouse and family of the johns, indicate that the individual was either engaged in a conversation with a prostitute or was seen patrolling in a known area of prostitution. Another program, also designed to shame johns, involves the publication of johns' names in local newspapers. Similar to "Dear John" letters, the intent behind this approach is to shame the johns and deter them from future solicitations. In 1992, three Canadian cities (Winnipeg, Regina and Ottawa) began publishing the names of known johns.

Recommendation for Buffalo

While on the surface it would appear that shaming approaches are suitable, we believe there are several disadvantages that must be taken into account. First, there is no concrete evidence that shaming johns will have a deterrent effect on future solicitations of prostitutes. Second, pain and suffering may inadvertently be inflicted upon the john's family. Third, shaming the johns only serves to transfer prostitution to another area; it does not eliminate the problem. Fourth, some approaches run the risk of humiliating an innocent person. Finally, the question of the legality of publishing names is raised.

Just how effective John TV is as a deterrent is not clear. There is no way to determine how many people watch the program or record it on a VCR. Former Buffalo Police Commissioner R. Gil Kerlikowske was skeptical of the proposal until he talked to his counterparts in Kansas City, who say it's made a real difference. However, Kansas City's program publishes information on all men arrested for solicitation, not just three time losers.

In order to minimize the potential negative impacts of shaming, yet take advantage of any deterrent effect that may exist, we recommend that the City continue its existing policy of broadcasting on John TV the names and photos of persons who have been arrested and convicted for soliciting a prostitute at least three times. With such a lengthy arrest record, it is unlikely that the person is innocent. Further, by this point more lenient approaches have failed and more drastic measures are clearly necessary.

D. AUTOMOBILE SEIZURES AND FORFEITURES

Buffalo, NY

While Buffalo does have an impounding ordinance on the books, it is rarely used because the City only owns one tow truck.

Portland, Oregon

In December 1989, the Portland City Council approved an ordinance that allows police to seize an automobile driven by anyone whose license has been suspended for drunk driving or who has been accused of soliciting a prostitute. Automobiles are held in a city lot until they are sold at auction or returned to their owner. The police must go through a civil forfeiture hearing in order to keep a car. Because offenders must pay the cost of enforcement, towing and storage, the program largely pays for itself. Two arrests for soliciting a prostitute is all it takes for someone to lose a car forever. On the first offense, a car may be released if the driver has no prior record of prostitution-related activities and agrees to pay for towing, storage and the officer's time. All owners of the automobile, including a spouse, must also sign an agreement not to allow its use in such activities in the future. After a second offense, the driver forfeits the automobile. Most first-time offenders have abided by the agreements. The current recidivism rate is about one percent. Seizures of vehicles in Oregon are sanctioned by civil laws that allow authorities to take property used in committing a crime. Prosecutors need show only "a preponderance of the evidence," rather than guilt beyond a reasonable doubt, to justify taking a car. The Oregon ACLU, which has challenged the practice, argues that the seizures often constitute a much harsher punishment than the maximum allowed \$2,500 fine for soliciting a prostitute.

Connecticut

In 1997, the Connecticut House of Representatives approved a bill providing that people who use cars to patronize prostitutes will lose their vehicles for 48 hours. The bill, approved 143-1, was enacted to update a previous law already on the books allowing police to seize cars from men who solicit prostitutes from an automobile. That law allowed the owner to reclaim the car after paying all towing and storage costs, and was initially seen as effective, as police in Hartford and other big cities began towing away dozens of vehicles from men charged with soliciting a prostitute. The men had to find other ways home, such as a ride with a friend, bus or a cab -- a punishment hailed by both neighborhood groups and police. But police soon found the law difficult to enforce on a long-term basis. The law required a conviction for police to keep the car and required police to file seizure papers within 10 days of the towing. Police also had to pay storage fees until a case was completed. By 1996, Hartford police had largely stopped seizing cars altogether.

Recommendation for Buffalo

Since the recidivism rate among johns is almost zero without seizing their vehicles, and the

strategy may be costly to implement, we do not recommend its adoption in Buffalo at this time. If recidivism becomes a problem, one strategy may be for the City to subcontract with a private tow truck company.

F. WARNING LETTER TO SUSPECTED JOHNS

Minneapolis, Minnesota

Two Minneapolis housewives riding in a garishly painted Dodge van spot a prostitute climbing into a white sports car. With a touch of the accelerator, the chase is on. Bouncing down Lake Street at about 40 mph, the van swerves down an alley in pursuit of the Honda, which picks up speed as the van's headlights loom up from behind. The van bears down on the low-slung car, forcing the driver to pull over. One housewife points a searchlight in the startled face of the driver, while the other jots down his license plate number. A week later, the registered owner of the car receives a letter from Minneapolis police at his Burnsville home, warning him that someone using his vehicle was seen picking up a prostitute in a neighborhood that has "declared war on prostitution and drug dealers." Included in the letter is a questionnaire asking him to explain what the car was doing in the neighborhood. Responding is optional.

According to South Minneapolis residents, the patrols became a necessity to battle a rise in the sex trade brought on by increasing crack sales in their neighborhoods and the disbanding of the Minneapolis Police vice squad. The key weapon in the battle to take back the streets is the john van, a 19-year-old Dodge plastered with hand-painted slogans, including "John B Gone," "Pimps are Wimps" and "Johns' license plate numbers taken 24 hours a day." The van is supported in part by a grant from Minneapolis Mayor Sharon Sayles Belton. It is staffed with a megaphone and cell phone to use in case of emergencies, a searchlight to see license plate numbers, a tape player to record any threats and socks, hats and crackers for the prostitutes. Patrols also carry pamphlets referring women to PRIDE, a Minneapolis advocacy group that helps prostitutes find shelter and other services.

Recommendation for Buffalo

Although sending letters to the owners of vehicles spotted soliciting prostitution may be a reasonable activity for block clubs and other organizations on a volunteer basis, we do not believe that City resources should be used in this manner.

STRATEGIES AIMED AT PROSTITUTES

A. TEMPORARY RESTRAINING ORDERS

San Diego, California

In San Diego, two police officers took the unusual approach of obtaining temporary restraining orders (TROs) against prostitutes, in order to prevent them from frequenting certain geographic

locations.

The officers began by compiling a list of 69 prostitutes who frequented the area. They then took their idea to a judge, asking him to research the legality of a restraining order involving multiple plaintiffs and multiple defendants. The judge advised them that the idea appeared to be legally sound, and could be done with a single restraining order, as opposed to multiple orders. This helped the officers to pitch the idea of a united business community to potential plaintiffs.

The officers contacted about 35 business owners, managers and landlords, explaining their plan and asking each to be part of the area TRO. Twenty-eight businesses agreed to the plan. Each plaintiff business documented problems or damage they had suffered as a result of prostitution. Problems cited included littering on the property (used condoms, underwear and trash), vandalism, loss of customers, changes in business hours (closing earlier) and an increased number of employees working the late shift for added protection. A standard TRO requires a defendant to remain at least 100 yards away from the plaintiff. Thus, the officers had at least one plaintiff every 100 yards. They also had plaintiffs on every corner, to prevent the prostitutes from simply moving around the corner.

The officers obtained the TRO against 31 prostitutes, of whom officers located and served 24 with their TRO paperwork. Sixteen of the 24 showed up in court two weeks later to contest the order. After hearing arguments from both the prostitutes and officers, the judge upheld the TRO against 23 of the 24. The judge also upheld the TRO against the eight women who chose not to show up in court to contest the order (a standard procedure).

The judge explained to the defendants that they were not prevented from being in the area. They were simply prohibited from engaging in the behavior that lends itself to prostitution (flagging down motorists, loitering on corners, repeatedly walking up and down the street, etc.). Violations of the order would result in an immediate five days in jail and a \$1,000 fine.

According to the San Diego Police, the TRO had immediate and positive results. For the first month after the TRO, the prostitutes disappeared from the area. Since then, local businesses have reported seeing a marked improvement. One hotel reported that profits increased 15 to 20%. Crimes directly attributable to prostitution, such as grand theft, pickpocketing and vandalism have completely disappeared. Pimps and johns no longer cruise the area, and traffic has noticeably decreased.

Recommendation for Buffalo

The use of a TRO should be pursued for the Grant-Ferry business area.

B. OUTREACH ACTIVITIES

Buffalo, NY

Several organizations in Buffalo currently provide outreach to women, including sex workers. Buffalo Area Outreach Network includes groups like HUB, Group Ministries, and Geneva B.

Scruggs that have programs with funding to do outreach to street prostitutes. Some operate out of mobile vans and some go door to door. Typically these programs provide literature, bleach kits, testing referrals, referrals to TRY House or Beacon Center and condoms. However, organizations are often limited in their geographic scope by their funding source. Further, the funding could dry up at any time. Buffalo does not have a citywide outreach program focused specifically on prostitutes with a constant funding stream and a skilled staff.

For drug-addicted prostitutes, Buffalo's Beacon Center, located in the Ellicott Square Building, offers an outpatient alcohol and drug treatment program known as the Magdalene Program. The Erie County District Attorney will grant an ACD to persons convicted of prostitution if they attend and complete the Magdalene Program. This generally requires cooperation among the District Attorney's office, the judge, and the public defender handling the case and offenders are sentenced and monitored through Drug Court. The program is seen as very successful in terms of low recidivism, participant lifestyle changes, and re-entry into the workforce or continuing education. Since its inception in 1997, thirty persons have graduated, with only one re-arrest. Unlike other substance abuse programs, the Magdalene Program is designed specifically for prostitutes. Preliminary figures showing savings to social services are significant.

Community leaders opened Buffalo's TRY House in December 1997 in response to a disturbing observation: younger and younger women were turning to prostitution. A three-story, former convent on Buffalo's East Side, TRY House provides a supervised shelter for up to 10 young women between the ages of 16-25 who were involved in street prostitution or at risk for becoming involved. It is designed as a place for young women who show a desire and commitment to seek alternatives to prostitution.

So far, success has been limited. While the anticipated stay of each woman is six months to one year, of the 18 women who have entered to date, most have remained for 3-4 months and only 2 have stayed an entire year. Tymesia Wiley, program director, says it is crucial that the home's staff include a mix of professional counselors and individuals that draw off of real life experiences. A former prostitute who works with the Prostitution Task Force has developed a program called "Three C's: Confrontation, Conversation, and Closure" for residents, funded by fees from the John School. Residents' days are filled with counseling, schooling and visiting with family.

TRY House gets women from court mandates, referrals from Compass House and similar programs, and by conducting its own outreach into the community. Some residents also attend the Beacon Center's Magdalene Program. Upon completion of the program, efforts will be made to place each young woman in a safe, permanent living situation. Follow-up and aftercare will be provided.

New York City

In the early 1980s, when the New York City community began mobilizing around the cause of AIDS, a Manhattan-based physician named Joyce Wallace became aware that certain populations of women who are at high risk of HIV infection were being largely ignored by the city's efforts. Working out of her car, Dr. Wallace began distributing free condoms and HIV

tests to women on the street. Her efforts materialized into the Foundation for Research on Sexually Transmitted Diseases, Inc. (FROST'D), which was incorporated in 1986 to sponsor research on sexually transmitted diseases, especially HIV, among New York City's street walking prostitutes. FROST'D's research, supervised by Dr. Joyce Wallace, revealed not only that increasing numbers of these women were becoming HIV infected, but also that the women on the street had little access to any sort of support or medical care. Today FROST'D provides direct social services to these prostitutes through the following programs:

1. Care Van - In 1988, using a van donated by Ansell America, makers of Lifestyles condoms, FROST'D's staff began reaching out to streetwalkers on their strolls, offering them free condoms and bleach kits, education on risk reduction practices, HIV counseling and testing, Hepatitis B and syphilis blood screening and referrals to social services including drug treatment. Within nine years, the Foundation had tested over 4,000 street walking prostitutes and had reached thousands more with outreach and education efforts. For many of these marginalized women, the Care Van is their only link to support and medical services. The Care Van is on the streets four days and five nights a week.

2. Care Van Syringe Exchange - Since May 1995, the Care Van has been operating a syringe exchange. The program operates in the field three days a week, for clients who are at risk for HIV infection due to injecting drug use. The Care Van syringe exchange, working in tandem with OTSMU-Options, offers counseling and referrals to methadone maintenance and drug rehabilitation programs, distributes information about safer sex practices and advocates on the behalf of clients.

3. Off the Street Mobile Unit (OTSMU-Options) - In October 1992, FROST'D began OTSMU-Options, a drop-in center for street walking prostitutes and homeless women, located in a motor home. OTSMU provides food, showers, clothes, sleeping bags, condoms, dental dams, informational literature and needle cleaning bleach kits. OTSMU outreach workers assist clients in obtaining personal identification such as birth certificates and social security cards to apply for public assistance benefits. Case managers facilitate referrals to community agencies offering more specialized services such as drug detoxification, drug treatment, methadone maintenance, emergency housing and health care. Because street-based women are at risk for multiple medical and social problems, the OTSMU purpose is multifaceted with the ultimate goal of helping women achieve a healthier life.

In the future, FROST'D hopes to expand its mobile outreach program to include a complete mobile primary care facility that will provide basic medical and gynecological care, treatment options for HIV infection and a methadone maintenance program directly to women in their communities.

Chicago

Tucked close by Chicago's Wrigley Field, Genesis House is an unobtrusive three-story building where prostitutes try to go straight. Seven days a week, around the clock, women turn up for a shower, a snack or a shoulder to cry on. They are never pressured to give up life on the street. Women are allowed to decide whether to embark on full-scale, residential rehabilitation. "We're

here to plant the seed, not to be judgmental," says outreach worker Gloria Moya, a Genesis House graduate. "On top of all their other issues, these women just don't trust anybody."

Genesis Executive Director Gayle McCoy and her staff lobby judges to consider their program as an alternative to jail. Genesis' track record is starting to win them over. About 70% of enrollees complete the program, and 80% of graduates don't relapse, says McCoy, who bases her estimates on follow-up visits with former clients. Without Genesis House, says Raymond Risley of the Chicago police department, "these women don't have the tools to get back on their feet." Residents' days are organized around counseling, classes, household chores and visits with caseworkers. Opened in 1983 by a British-born feminist named Edwina Gately, Genesis House is one of just a handful of U.S. recovery centers specifically for prostitutes. As social service and law enforcement agencies have learned about its success rate and unusual approach in dealing with seemingly intractable clients, it has become a model for similar programs from Florida to Thailand. However, Genesis House also finds itself in financial jeopardy. The loss of half a million dollars in federal funds has forced the agency into an unexpected scramble to maintain its programs; it has had to lay off about half of its 25 paid staff members, while the use of volunteers has tripled.

Canada

Although insufficient to fully meet the needs of every prostitute, some Canadian social programs for prostitutes such as job counseling, emotional counseling, relocation, retraining and medical services have emerged. Such programs include Edmonton's Kindred House, Crossroads/Outreach House, Boyle McCauley Health Centre and Calgary's EXIT program.

Edmonton's Kindred House is a drop-in resource center that has been in operation since December 1994. This facility offers a number of programs and services to prostitutes including a kitchen area with food provided by the Edmonton Food Bank, "health for two" project that provides milk coupons and health information to pregnant prostitutes and a computer training program that helps prostitutes acquire marketable skills. Kindred House also refers female prostitutes in need of a place to sleep or further services to Edmonton's Women in Need House, Crossroads House or to the Women's Emergency Shelter. Edmonton's Crossroads/Outreach House serves street-involved adolescents, especially those involved in prostitution. The program is comprised of two components. The first component is a safe house that provides food and shelter for youth wishing to leave street life. The second component employs an outreach worker who is on the street five nights a week and can be contacted 24 hours a day.

The Boyle McCauley Health Centre an Edmonton facility that provides health services and drug information to individuals without resources for health care and/or no fixed residence. Many street prostitutes fall into one or both of these categories. Programs offered include an AIDS prevention program, a needle exchange service and medical services.

The EXIT program is a community outreach program serving prostitutes in Calgary. Two outreach workers provide year-round information and services to prostitutes out of a van. Clients are given food such as sandwiches, milk and other dairy products in the summer and hot meals during the winter. Clients are also given condoms and information concerning sexually

transmitted diseases and other health matters.

Portland, Oregon

Portland's Council for Prostitution Alternatives (CPA) came into being during the Spring and Summer of 1984 when feminists, neighborhood activists and representatives from a broad spectrum of social services and police and probation departments began meeting at the request of City and County commissioners to discuss the findings of the City Club's Report on Prostitution. The report, released in August of that year, advocated the zoning and decriminalization of prostitution in Portland. CPA's philosophy states that prostitution is bought and sold rape, and therefore dehumanizing, abusive and life threatening. Prostituted women do not "freely" choose abusive relationships, do not choose prostitution as a form of sexual freedom and/or pleasure, and are not empowered, emotionally or financially, through prostitution. Survivors of prostitution, according to CPA, should neither be treated as victims to be rescued nor as criminals to be punished. Rather, they should be empowered to take control of their own lives, to have increased options available to them, to attain a sense of dignity, and become self-sufficient members of the community.

From 1984 through June 1989, CPA contracted with social services that provided counseling and direct assistance to survivors of prostitution. Since July 1989, all counseling, education, advocacy, case management and direct assistance to prostitutes have been provided directly by CPA. In May 1987, CPA incorporated as a non-profit agency. That summer, CPA entered into coalition with other domestic and sexual violence prevention agencies to create the Rose apartments, a 57-unit apartment building, where women may live rent-free. CPA receives funding from the City and county, as well as from foundations and private individuals. It has been honored with numerous awards and with national and international recognition.

Recommendation for Buffalo

Social services should be made available to prostitutes, both male and female, who wish to get out of the sex trade. These should be long-term services and include job training, GED training and psychiatric services as needed. More persons arrested for prostitution should be referred to Beacon Center's very successful drug rehabilitation program designed specifically for prostitutes. TRY House should be expanded and publicized based on the FROST'D and Portland models. Drug rehabilitation, transitional housing and day care should all be part of the mix. Materials should be tailored and designed specifically for prostitutes. A van should be purchased to travel throughout the community.

Human Life International (HLI) sponsors a program called "Magdalene Rescue & Rehabilitation" (MR&R) that funds existing centers to rescue and rehabilitate children and women enslaved in prostitution by providing outreach to prostitutes and follow-up. Buffalo should reach out to HLI and other potential funding sources to provide a drop-in center for prostitutes, an aggressive outreach program and a long-term residential center along the TRY House model.

STRATEGIES AIMED AT JOHNS & PROSTITUTES

A. ENVIRONMENTAL DESIGN

The ENCANTO Group, funded under the Department of Justice ICOPS grant, completed a security assessment of three areas within the City of Buffalo. The Buffalo Police Department provided maps of the City indicating where prostitution arrests had been made during the last six months of 1998. The areas to be evaluated were then chosen by the Prostitution Task Force based on these arrest maps. The analysis was based on the general guidelines found in the grant and on the principles of Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design.

The study was conducted by the ENCANTO Group, who produced a report including recommendations for three sites. The following are highlights from that report.

SURVEILLANCE

Surveillance is a design concept directed primarily at decreasing crime opportunity. Its strategies typically are classified as natural (i.e. windows), organized (i.e. police patrols, blockwatch patrols) and mechanical (i.e. lighting). The primary focus of a surveillance strategy is to facilitate observation. It also effects an access control strategy because it gives potential offenders an increased perception of the risk of being observed and reported.

Lighting

One of the three areas assessed by the ENCANTO Group was the neighborhood around the intersection of Maryland & West Streets, which is dominated by multiple housing units and absentee landlords. The A&A Food Mart on the north west corner of the intersection is the focal point of the neighborhood. There are known "crack houses" located within the apartments at 125 West Street that attract deviant users at all hours of the day and night. The predominant period of drug dealing is in the very late evening and early morning hours.

The neighborhood has a very active Neighborhood Association that attempts to deal with the problems in the area. They have been instrumental in getting several abandoned houses removed. These houses were used as crack houses and created a problem within the neighborhood. In interviews with members of the Neighborhood Association, it was apparent that the crack houses were drawing prostitutes to the neighborhood. None of the prostitutes that were identified by people living in the neighborhood were recognized as being members of the immediate neighborhood.

The natural surveillance in the areas is limited during the daylight hours and early evening hours by old growth trees. During the hours of darkness, these trees also impede lighting from the streetlights. The darkest areas in the neighborhood coincide with the known crack houses. Normal users of the area tend to frequent the convenience market on the northwest corner and the T-shirt store on the southwest corner. However, they appear to conduct their business and return home. There does not appear to be much socializing on the street level.

The ENCANTO Group concluded that trees should be trimmed so that the available light is not wasted illuminating leaves. The light should be directed to illuminate more of the sidewalk area, especially in front of the known drug houses at 125 West Street and 291 Maryland Street. The area on the East Side of A&A Food Market should also have more illumination than is currently provided. The owner of the market is a large stakeholder in the neighborhood and would probably cooperate by installing additional lighting if asked.

The Group also assessed the area south of the intersection of Grant and Ferry Streets, between Ferry and New Hampshire Street. The Group found that the lighting at the intersection and on the corners makes it difficult to see past Blockbuster Video on the east side of the street or Rent Way on the west side of the street.

According to ENCANTO, the lighting at the intersection of Grant and Ferry Streets is five times the recommended amount of light for an intersection. Moving south of the intersection on the east side of the street in front of Blockbuster Video, the lighting is still three times the amount required. This comes from the lighting under the overhang at Blockbuster. Directly south of Blockbuster Video is an entry way to the Italian Meat Market. The lighting at the entry is also above the recommended lighting requirements. However, once the building line is crossed it becomes extremely dark.

The area between the Italian Meat Market and the car lot is slightly lower than the recommended light level. Behind Blockbuster Video, the Italian Meat Market and the car lot is an area that shows signs of being used to eat and drink (party). It also shows signs of being used for prostitution, drug activity, and gang activity. These areas have enough light for deviant users to feel comfortable, without worrying about being seen from the street. Both of these areas are private property and ENCANTO recommended that arrangements be made with the owners to install motion lighting to cover the areas that people are using for deviant activities.

On the west side of Ferry Street, the light is adequate until the end of the Rent Way building. From there, the lighting decreases all the way to New Hampshire Street. This area is unique in that it contains small businesses on the street front and apartments on the second floor of the buildings. These apartments stretch backwards away from the street. Between the buildings are driveways that lead to parking areas in the rear. These driveways are dark, narrow and dangerous to passers by. It does not appear that any of the apartments are occupied at this time.

There are indications that the areas behind these buildings are being used by prostitutes, drug users, gang members and the homeless for places to live. Taking one step past the building line between any of the buildings puts a person in an area where there is not enough light to register on a light meter. Once out of the driveway area and into what was once the parking area, there is plenty of light to allow deviant users to be comfortable. Yet there is no way that an officer driving by could see into the areas behind the buildings. There is also no reason, other than a call for service, to make an officer feel the need to check there.

The ENCANTO Group recommends that this be remedied through installation of motion detector lighting fixtures. These fixtures could be mounted high enough to provide adequate lighting in the driveways. If put on a three to five minute "on" cycle, the police would know

when someone was behind the building as they were driving by.

Closed Circuit Television

The intersection of Virginia & Elmwood Streets was the third location assessed as part of the ENCANTO Group study. This area is dominated by the Buffalo Fire Department's station on the north west corner of Virginia and Elmwood, and by the Learning Center on the south west corner. The Group found that the area is appropriately lighted during the hours of darkness, and that the access control is good. The only entries to the area are from Cottage Street on the west and Virginia from the east. All roads going north south are one-way exiting the neighborhood.

Natural Surveillance in the area comes from the florist shop at the corner of Cottage and Virginia Streets as well as people walking in the neighborhood to and from Elmwood Avenue. The fire fighters that are stationed at the fire department's building are unable to add natural surveillance to the area because of the way the building was designed and built. Changing the environment around the fire station is not practical at this time.

The area to the rear of the Learning Center is a large parking lot that could be used as a play area for young children. By adding such game areas as four square and hopscotch, parents would be drawn to the area to allow their children to play. However, adding shelter from the elements or places to sit for the parents would also draw the deviant element to the area. Removing the fence around the parking lot is not recommended because of the large amount of traffic and the speed of the traffic in the area.

The direct needs of the fire department and Sherwood Florist do not allow for any changes to be made in traffic patterns. The lighting in the area is adequate, with the exception of the lights blocked by tree limbs, and does not need upgrading. The Learning Center, although it may provide activity support and therefore natural surveillance, would not be useful to deter the activities of prostitutes due to the time prostitutes normally conduct business.

The ENCANTO Group concluded that this would be an excellent area to test Closed Circuit Television (CCTV). There are studies that show that where CCTV is used to monitor street activity, the crime rate goes down. In order to study this concept, the area could be posted indicating that CCTV is recording activity in the area. The notice alone would deter some deviant users from using the area for prostitution or other criminal activity. When it does not, the tapes generated would be useful in the prosecution of criminal behavior.

Recommendation for Buffalo

Buffalo should improve lighting and work with area businesses and block clubs to install motion detectors. The effectiveness of closed circuit television should be explored.

DRUG HOUSE ABATEMENT

The PTF has recently begun referring problem properties, specifically in the Maryland-West area, that are the locations of drug and prostitution activity to the U. S. Attorney's Save Our

Streets Task Force. The Task Force conducts interviews with landlords of these properties to warn them of the potential legal actions that might be taken using several federal, state and local laws, including the Bawdy House Law and the Nuisance Abatement Ordinance. In the case of the owner of the multiple dwelling at Maryland and West, the SOS Task Force was able to obtain his compliance to evict problem tenants and implement some CPTED recommendations to reduce the illegal activity.

Recommendation for Buffalo

The Prostitution Task Force welcomes the assistance of the SOS Task Force and will continue to route problem properties to them through the District Attorney's Community Prosecutor who works with both task forces.

TRAFFIC CALMING

City residents often complain that the volume of traffic - both during the day and throughout the night - is high in residential areas. Heavy traffic is often accompanied by horn blowing and by drivers leaning out the car windows and calling to or shouting at women on the streets. Occasionally, bitter interchanges between johns and local residents take place.

Yet concerns are raised in relation to road closure schemes as well, including the fear that a road closure scheme may act to design in rather than design out the problem. That is, by placing physical barriers around an area, the enclosed area might become a home for a range of criminal activities and attract a number of undesirables who might see the enclosed area as affording them some degree of protection from the police who would have difficulty pursuing them in police cars.

A second concern, mostly among residents of the surrounding streets, is the fear of displacement. Prostitution, they argue, is the world's oldest profession and therefore unlikely to disappear. The expectation held by many is that prostitution would be displaced in some form to neighboring areas or that the clients and the prostitutes would find alternative, and possibly even more undesirable, methods of doing business.

In order to slow commuter traffic through Buffalo's neighborhoods, a variety of proposals have been presented. They include the following:

1. Using gates to isolate neighborhoods.
2. Outfitting intersections with paving stones and electronic eyes. One plan calls for seven such intersections on the lower West Side, one on each east/west street.
3. Installing brick or cobblestone crosswalks. The effect would be similar to the incised pavement leading up to toll booths. The change in surface is designed to make you slow down.
4. Installing alternating bands of brick or cobblestone amidst the asphalt on longer blocks like Ashland and Norwood between Summer and Bryant. Or, replacing all of the asphalt with paving

stones. This would not only slow traffic, but also would beautify the street and enhance property values.

5. Allowing parking on both sides of the street, 24 hours a day, from May to November. This has a narrowing effect, which slows down drivers. The theory here is that we are dealing with an essentially seasonal problem, since in this climate, snow and ice are nature's own traffic calmers.

6. Restoring one-way streets to two-way. In theory, when you have oncoming traffic, you cannot drive as fast.

Finsbury Park, North London, England

The Finsbury Park area of North London implemented a road closure scheme in 1984. Within a relatively short period of time, a remarkable transformation occurred. Soliciting and prostitution virtually disappeared, and the area was transformed from a noisy and hazardous neighborhood into a relatively tranquil residential area. Not only that, but also many of the fears and anxieties about the possible negative effects of the strategy did not occur. Instead, the overall result appeared extremely positive and superseded even the most optimistic expectancies. The benefits that resulted from the initiative included the following:

1. An increased sense of security. This was particularly evident among the female residents in the area.
2. A reduction in the volume of traffic. The volume of traffic circulating in the area - particularly late at night - declined considerably. This, in turn, reduced the level of noise and congestion and made the streets safer for all the members of the community.
3. A reduction in the number of crimes reported. In the 12-month period prior to the implementation of the road closure scheme, 475 crimes were reported to the police in the area. Of these, 110 were motor vehicle crimes and 121 involved burglary. In the 12 months after the scheme was implemented, the total number of reported crimes decreased to 275, with the number of serious crimes going down by almost 50%.
4. An improved relationship among the police, the public and the local government. As a result of the links that were developed among the police, the public and the local authority during the implementation of the strategy, more meetings were set up to devise coordinated ways to deal with other problems in the area. Prior to this initiative, the public's confidence in the police was extremely low. However, as a result of taking the residents' concerns seriously, relations improved considerably.
5. The anticipated level of displacement did not occur. The expectation that prostitutes and their clients would move to surrounding areas was not born out. The surrounding streets remained unaffected, and the evidence gathered from nearby neighborhoods indicated that few of the women who had been operating in Finsbury Park had moved to new locations.

The apparent lack of displacement, more than any of the other effects of this initiative, is probably most remarkable. Researchers explain, however, that the belief in the inevitability of displacement may be based on a conception of motivation of prostitutes and their clients that is not accurate. An examination of the Finsbury Park prostitutes and their clients provides some indication as to why the anticipated level of displacement did not occur.

The prostitutes who worked in Finsbury were not a homogeneous group. They expressed variable commitment to prostitution and operated under different levels of pressure and incentives. Taken very broadly, the large number of women who worked in the Finsbury Park area between 1983 and 1986 can be divided into three groups. The first group was comprised of about 30 women who lived fairly locally, had a long-term commitment to prostitution, and had been in the business for a number of years. The second group involved women and girls who came to London principally for the purpose of practicing prostitution. This group came to London and Finsbury Park in particular, either because they had heard that it was a good area to work or they had a contact address. The ready availability of cheap accommodation that was let out to prostitutes by local landlords undoubtedly provided an attraction to women who were thinking of working as prostitutes in London. It is estimated that there were about 200-300 such girls engaged in prostitution in Finsbury Park over this period. The third category was comprised of women who engaged in prostitution on a much more sporadic and temporary basis. Many of these women drifted in and out of prostitution and were on average much younger than the other two groups. The very fact that they drifted in and out of prostitution and were sometimes involved for only very short periods makes any estimation of their numbers extremely difficult, but they almost certainly constituted the largest group.

Intensive policing in the area prior to the implementation of the road closure scheme undoubtedly deterred many of those women whose commitment to prostitution was sporadic. Others were, over this period, subject to systematic surveillance and arrest, which made soliciting increasingly difficult to pursue. Since the level of fines were also increased during this period, the activities of the local courts provided a further disincentive. Thus, over a period of about one-year, most of the girls gave up prostitution or moved back home or elsewhere. Most importantly, the message was transmitted to other potential prostitutes that Finsbury Park was becoming an extremely difficult place to work. There did remain a hard core of about 20 women operating in the area, but most of these found it more congenial to work from home via advertisements.

As for the johns, their level of motivation was also found to be much lower than was previously assumed. Most of them seemed to be deterred by a police warning. The profile that emerged of the average john was that he was between 35 and 45 years of age, married and living in surrounding suburban areas. The occupational distribution of the 79 johns for whom formal warnings were issued was that 15 were unemployed, 14 were manual workers, 5 were from service occupations, 10 were salesmen, 23 were tradesmen and 12 were from the managerial and professional classes. Thus, the motivations of both the prostitutes and their clients were highly differentiated, and, in many cases, they exhibited a much lower level of commitment than was expected. Through a combination of interventions that embodied both proactive and deterrent elements, the problem was reduced with an apparently low level of displacement.

Folks in Finsbury Park are convinced that the problems associated with prostitution could have been effectively overcome only through a multi-agency initiative. The comprehensive resolution of the problem included not only a diverse police initiative aimed simultaneously at prostitutes, johns and pimps, but also required environmental changes and an organized residents association to initiate, coordinate and monitor the various processes. The interventions of the police and the legislative council, who approved the road closure scheme, proved to be mutually reinforcing. The residents believe that while the police on their own may have been able to maintain the problem within reasonable limits, the situation required a more permanent disincentive in order to achieve satisfactory long-term results. By the same token, the road closure scheme on its own, without any organized police presence, may have created a more entrenched and contained red light district.

Recommendation for Buffalo

Buffalo should implement a traffic-management scheme. This scheme should be developed through a series of regular meetings among the police, local elected officials and local residents. It should be designed to work in combination with more intensive forms of policing.

B. NON-ENFORCEMENT ZONES

Zones of tolerance can be found in virtually every major city around the world. A zone of tolerance is an area that has been unofficially recognized by city council, residents, businesses, prostitutes and police as a place where prostitutes can freely conduct business. Proponents argue that there are several advantages to creating zones of tolerance. First, these areas keep the nuisance of prostitution out of residential areas. Second, prostitutes are given a relatively safe and legal area from which to work. Third, police and other enforcement agencies can better regulate prostitution when it is confined to a small area. Finally, supporters argue that by designating specific areas for street prostitutes to operate, it becomes easier to protect, inform and assist them in their efforts to leave the industry. A "safe house" could be established in such an area, while the safety and security of all people in the community would be ensured. Supporters claim that unofficial zones of tolerance do not solve all the problems associated with street prostitution, but that they do help to ease tensions between communities, police, businesses and prostitutes.

However, unlike New York, Phoenix or Boston, there is no red light district in Buffalo. Prostitution in the City of Buffalo does not appear to have any genuine area of operations. The prostitution crime map furnished by the Buffalo Police Department shows a cluster of prostitution arrests on the West Side close to the central City, but also on Genesee Street all the way to the City line.

Recommendation for Buffalo

We do not support the creation of a non-enforcement zone or zone of tolerance in Buffalo. The community survey conducted as part of the ICOPS grant from the Department of Justice did not demonstrate community support for such a scheme. Further, Buffalo's geography and the

distribution of the problem at the present time do not lend itself to such a solution.

C. LEGALIZATION AND DECRIMINALIZATION

Although the two terms are often used interchangeably, decriminalization and legalization are not the same thing. Decriminalization means that activities are no longer crimes and participants are not subject to criminal penalties. Under decriminalization, prostitutes and prostitution businesses would operate under the same civil laws as other individuals and businesses. By contrast, legalization allows prostitution to operate selectively under government control and special laws (as for example legal brothels and escort agencies do now).

The argument for decriminalization maintains that offenses relating to prostitution should be removed from the criminal code. Other criminal code provisions, along with municipal by-laws, would be used to deal with the annoyances associated with street prostitution. This view maintains that decriminalizing prostitution-related activities would allow authorities to allocate additional resources to addressing the social and economic problems associated with prostitution.

Proponents of legalization argue that prostitution is a social problem. Thus, instead of using the criminal code to deal with it, we should legalize and regulate it. Various suggestions on how to do so have been put forth. These include licensed brothels, the creation of "red light" districts and licensing of prostitutes with compulsory medical examinations. Proponents argue that the advantages of this approach include ease of enforcement, an improved self-image for prostitutes, a reduced need for pimps and others who exploit prostitutes, better control over public health and an increase in tax revenue for municipal governments.

Brothels have been legalized in many countries around the world including Holland, West Germany and the United States. Advocates of legalized brothels say that state regulation in this manner would end the stigmatization of sex trade workers, reduce the AIDS epidemic, create new taxation profits and eliminate the annoyances associated with street prostitution.

Conversely, critics say that where such legislation exists, it has not protected prostitutes, nor has it helped them get out of the profession. Instead, they claim that legalized brothels have made it more difficult for prostitutes to keep what they earn, and that working conditions remain deplorable because power over the prostitutes has not disappeared but simply changed hands from the pimp to the state. Furthermore, the prostitutes face fierce competition and high rents, which translate into longer shifts to remain competitive and keep their rooms. Surprisingly, even after all this regulation, AIDS cases among prostitutes are higher in Germany than in the U.K.

The problems associated with legalizing brothels are not unique to West Germany. In Nevada, there appears to be little difference in living conditions and deprivation between brothels and prisons. The compulsory HIV testing for all prostitutes in Nevada brothels gives clients a false sense of security. They assume that the prostitutes are HIV negative and tend to argue against the use of condoms, thereby increasing the risk of sexually transmitted diseases.

Recommendation for Buffalo

Since it is unlikely that City or State officials could ever be convinced to decriminalize or legalize prostitution in Buffalo, there is nothing to be gained by debating the merits of either.

D. MULTI-AGENCY APPROACHES

San Francisco, California

San Francisco's First Offender Prostitution Program (FOPP) is a unique collaboration between law enforcement, public health and private agencies to fundamentally shift their approach to prostitution, aiding women and girls to permanently exit the criminal justice system. A dynamic departure from the previous practice of revolving door arrests of prostitutes with little or no services for women and girls, under FOPP, resources are reallocated from prosecution and jailing to prevention, education and treatment.

Launched in March 1995, supporters claim FOPP has had very positive results. Of the first 1,512 men completing FOPP's John School, only 14 had reoffended. FOPP is a model of interagency local government collaboration in partnership with private community-based agencies, actively engaging the District Attorney's Office, Public Health Department, Police Department, SAGE Project, juvenile justice system, Probation Department, Sheriff's Office, Courts, Public Defender, Mayor's Office, therapeutic/recovery services, job training and employment services, neighborhood groups and prostitute survivors. Proponents claim that the return on investment has been remarkable, dramatically lowering recidivism, conserving resources in criminal justice and health care and improving the quality of life in impacted neighborhoods.

Recognizing that the root issues of prostitution are sexual exploitation, abuse, addiction, and violence, FOPP consists of four primary components:

1. Prevention Services for Girls. 75%-95% of all 13-18 year old girls in the justice system have been victims of violence and/or sexual abuse. FOPP provides counseling, treatment, life skills training and support for girls in detention and on probation to aid them to permanently exit the criminal justice system and to rebuild their lives free of sexual exploitation, prostitution and abuse. Also, FOPP is now identifying girl victims of trafficking and intervening to assist them to escape from exploitation and prevent re-victimization.
2. Intervention for Adult Women. FOPP provides in-custody and community-based assessments, referrals, peer support, training and case management for women trying to exit prostitution. Specialized programs have been established in jail and at substance abuse facilities to integrate sexual exploitation, abuse and other issues common to prostitutes as part of recovery.
3. Arrests and Education for Johns. The Police Department conducts decoy operations to arrest

male customers of prostitutes and the District Attorney invites first-time offenders to enroll in an eight-hour seminar in lieu of prosecution. Prostitute survivors and educators on the justice system, public health, domestic violence and trafficking in girls address the risks and impacts of prostitution to provide a unique rehabilitative experience for the customers. Administrative fees collected from participating johns fund intervention services for women prostitutes, prevention education and early intervention for girls.

Systemic Reform/Continuum of Services. FOPP is a paradigm shift from prosecuting prostitutes to targeting customers, addressing trafficking in girls, and building a continuum of prevention, early intervention, and rehabilitation for prostitutes and customers alike.

Recommendation for Buffalo

The Prostitution Task Force should continue to serve as a vehicle to bring stakeholders together to address this urgent issue. Task Force membership should be expanded to include: the Niagara District Council Member; the Ellicott District Council Member; Police Commissioner Rocco Diina; District Attorney Frank Clark; a representative of Hispanics United of Buffalo (HUB); representatives of area block clubs, Forever Elmwood and local businesses; officials from the Beacon Center and TRY House; Judge Robert Russell; and at least one former prostitute.

Further, the Task Force should arrange consultation with: members of the judiciary, including judges, lawyers and district attorneys; representatives of city departments and agencies; representatives from agencies and groups which serve women, youth and children; representatives from licensing commissions such as the Liquor Control Board and the city licensing commission; representatives from agencies and foundations sponsoring addiction research and rehabilitation; community police officers; affected resident groups and other stakeholders from across the city; and appropriate members of county, state and federal government.

The Task Force should adopt formal by-laws, a mission statement and should have staff support. Raising the cost of participation in the John School could fund these activities.

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. The Prostitution Task Force should continue to serve as a vehicle to bring stakeholders together to address this chronic problem. The Task Force should adopt formal by-laws, a mission statement and should hire part-time staff support.

2. The Buffalo Police Department should continue making prostitution-related arrests, with the bulk of enforcement directed towards arresting johns on a citywide basis. Prostitutes show a 66% repeat offender status whereas johns only show an 8% recidivism rate. Arrest is a deterrent for johns, not for prostitutes. Thus, the primary strategy for reducing prostitution in Buffalo

should be to eliminate the prostitution customer base.

3. Alternative sentencing, including the John School and the Magdalene Program, should be continued for offenders, and more persons arrested for prostitution-related offenses should be referred to these programs. Education has shown results in every city that uses a john school. In Buffalo, John School fees should be raised in order to continue and expand support for programs for prostitutes. Preliminary figures showing savings to social services for those completing the Beacon Center program are significant. More persons arrested for prostitution should be referred to the Beacon Center's Magdalene Program and to TRY House.

4. Buffalo should improve lighting, implement a traffic-management scheme, and adopt other CPTED measures, particularly in multiple dwelling rentals, to reduce prostitution. This scheme should be developed through a series of regular meetings among the police, local elected officials and local residents. It should be designed to work in combination with more intensive forms of policing. Multiple dwellings that are sites of prostitution should be targeted for drug house abatement in conjunction with the U. S. Attorney's SOS Task Force.

5. Social services should be made available to prostitutes, both male and female, who wish to get out of the sex trade. These should be long-term services and include job training, GED training and psychiatric services as needed. TRY House should be expanded and publicized based on the FROST'D and Portland models. Drug rehabilitation, transitional housing and day care should all be part of the mix. Materials should be tailored and designed specifically for prostitutes. A van should be purchased to travel throughout the community.

6. The City should continue to broadcast on John TV the names and photos of persons who have been arrested for soliciting a prostitute at least three times. With such a lengthy arrest record, it is unlikely that the person is innocent. Further, by this point more lenient approaches have failed and more drastic measures are clearly necessary.

FOR MORE INFORMATION

Council for Prostitution Alternatives

65 SW Yamhill, 2nd floor

Portland, Oregon 97204

COYOTE (Call Off Your Old Tired Ethics) Seattle

16625 Redmond Way

Box M237

Redmond, Washington 98052

coyote@coyotesea.org

<http://www.coyotesea.org/>

Prostitutes of New York (PONY)

PO Box 199 Murray Hill Station

New York, New York 10106

212-713-5678

pony@panix.com

SAGE (Standing Against Global Exploitation) Project, Inc.

2286 25th Avenue

San Francisco, California 94116

415-564-7132

San Francisco Prostitution Task Force

Office of Supervisor Terence Hallinan

401 VanNess Avenue Room 308

San Francisco, California 94102

Sex Workers Alliance of Vancouver

Box 3075

Vancouver, British Columbia V6B 3X6

604-488-0710

swav@walnet.org

<http://www.walnet.org/swav/>

Sex Workers Outreach Project (SWOP)

PO Box 1453

Surry Hills NSW 1300

Australia

612-9319-4866

swop@rainbow.net.au

US PROStitutes Collective

PO Box 14512

San Francisco, California 94114

415-626-4114